

MAA "The College Mathematics Journal" Problem 1171:

For $x^3 - 2x^2 - x + 1 = 0$ with roots $a < b < c$ find $g = (a/b)^2 + (b/c)^2 + (c/a)^2$

Solution: Using standard cubic equation solutions one finds $a = -0.80193774$, $b = 0.55495813$, $c = 2.24697961$ as the roots giving $g = 10$. {Note: g uses squares, so for $a < b < c$ in this MAA problem g uses $b^2 < a^2 < c^2$ }

More generally for the cubic with real coefficients and all real roots

$$f(x) = x^3 + a_2x^2 + a_1x + a_0 = 0 = (x-a)(x-b)(x-c) = x^3 - (a+b+c)x^2 + (ab+ac+bc)x - abc$$

on defining the alternate of g , with inverted entries [$h=17$ for the Journal problem],

$$h = (b/a)^2 + (c/b)^2 + (a/c)^2$$

g and h can be found in terms of a given cubic's coefficients (assuming $a_0 = -abc \neq 0$) through the following formulas:

$$\text{Max}\{g, h\} = \{-B + \text{SquareRoot}[B^2 - 4C]\} / (2a_0^2) \quad \text{where}$$

$$B = -(2G + (a_1a_2 - a_0)^2); \quad C = G^2 - (a_1a_2 - a_0)^2(-5a_0^2 + 2a_0a_1a_2) \quad \text{with } G = -a_0a_2^3 - a_1^3 - 2a_0^2 + 3a_0a_1a_2$$

While $\text{Min}\{g, h\}$ goes with the minus sign on the square root. The sign is determined by

$$\text{Sign}(g - h) = \text{Sign}\{a^2(b^4 - c^4) + b^2(c^4 - a^4) + c^2(a^4 - b^4)\}$$

This is proven as follows:

Define g_0 (using $a_0 = -abc$)

$$(1a, b) \quad g_0 = a_0^2 g = (-abc)^2 [(a/b)^2 + (b/c)^2 + (c/a)^2]$$

And similarly for $h_0 = a_0^2 h$; h is introduced for determining the end result sign and its calculations following directly those of g . Direct calculation gives

$$(1c, d) \quad g_0 = (a^4c^2 + b^4a^2 + c^4b^2) = (a^2c + ab^2 + bc^2)^2 - 2(abc)(a^2b + ac^2 + b^2c)$$

Next define for use in (1d)

$$(1e, f) \quad X = a^2c + ab^2 + bc^2; \quad Y = a^2b + ac^2 + b^2c$$

X and Y are related by

$$(1g, h) \quad -a_1a_2 = (ab + ac + bc)(a + b + c) = (X + Y) - 3a_0 \implies Y = (3a_0 - a_1a_2) - X$$

Then inserting (1h) into (1d), written as $g_0 = X^2 + 2a_0Y$ (and similarly $h_0 = Y^2 + 2a_0X$) gives the quadratic equation for X , now in terms of g_0 ,

$$(2a) \quad X^2 - 2a_0X + [2a_0(3a_0 - a_1a_2) - g_0] = 0$$

with solution

$$(2b) \quad X = a_0 \pm \text{SqRt}(-5a_0^2 + 2a_0a_1a_2 + g_0)$$

Similarly Y satisfies (2a,b) with g_0 replaced by h_0 . In order to find g_0 we expand the first term in (1d), which is X^2 , in terms of roots, keeping the second term which includes X in terms of coefficients and g_0 . For the first term we have

$$(3a) \quad (a^2c+ab^2+bc^2)^2 = (a^4c^2+a^2b^4+b^2c^4)+2(a^3b^2c+a^2bc^3+ab^3c^2)$$

To proceed we evaluate the 3rd and 4th power terms by noting that a,b,c satisfy $f(x)=0$ so $x^3=-a_2x^2-a_1x-a_0$ and with it $x^4=-a_2x^3-a_1x^2-a_0x=(a_2^2-a_1)x^2+(a_1a_2-a_0)x+a_0a_2$. Inserting these expressions into (3a) evaluated at roots, $x=a,b,c$, gives, using the relations between coefficients and roots [$a_1=ab+ac+bc$, $a_2=-a-b-c$],

$$(3b,c) \quad (a^2c+ab^2+bc^2)^2 = [(a_2^2-a_1)[a^2c^2+a^2b^2+b^2c^2] - 2a_2(a^2b^2c+a^2bc^2+ab^2c^2)] \\ + [(a_1a_2-a_0)(ac^2+a^2b+b^2c) - 2a_1(ab^2c+a^2bc+abc^2)] + [a_0a_2(c^2+a^2+b^2) - 2a_0(b^2c+a^2b+ac^2)] \\ = [(a_2^2-a_1)[a^2c^2+a^2b^2+b^2c^2] - 2a_2(abc)a_1] + [(a_1a_2-a_0)Y - 2a_1(abc)(-a_2)] + [a_0a_2(c^2+a^2+b^2) - 2a_0Y]$$

To further evaluate these we also use the relations between coefficients and roots via

$$(3c,d) \quad a_1^2 = (ab+ac+bc)^2 = (a^2b^2+a^2c^2+b^2c^2) + 2(a^2bc+ab^2c+abc^2) \implies (a^2b^2+a^2c^2+b^2c^2) = (a_1^2 - 2a_0a_2)$$

$$(3e,f) \quad a_2^2 = (-a-b-c)^2 = (a^2+b^2+c^2) + 2(ab+ac+bc) \implies (a^2+b^2+c^2) = (a_2^2 - 2a_1)$$

Thus, using (3c), (1c) becomes, with Y given by (1h),

$$(4a,b) \quad g_0 = [(a_2^2-a_1)(a_1^2-2a_0a_2) - 2a_2(-a_0)a_1] + [(a_1a_2-a_0)Y - 2a_1(-a_0)(-a_2)] + [a_0a_2(a_2^2-2a_1) - 2a_0Y] + 2a_0Y \\ = [(a_2^2-a_1)(a_1^2-2a_0a_2) + a_0a_2(a_2^2-2a_1)] + (a_1a_2-a_0)((3a_0-a_1a_2) - X)$$

Using the solution for X from (2b) gives on rearranging to isolate the square root

$$(4c) \quad (a_1a_2-a_0)[\pm \text{SqRt}(-5a_0^2+2a_0a_1a_2+g_0)] \\ = [(a_2^2-a_1)(a_1^2-2a_0a_2) + a_0a_2(a_2^2-2a_1)] - (a_1a_2-a_0)(3a_0-a_1a_2) - a_0(a_1a_2-a_0) - g_0$$

Squaring this gives the final quadratic equation for g_0 for which the \pm in X disappears:

$$(4d) \quad (a_1a_2-a_0)^2(-5a_0^2+2a_0a_1a_2+g_0) \\ = \{[(a_2^2-a_1)(a_1^2-2a_0a_2) + a_0a_2(a_2^2-2a_1)] - (a_1a_2-a_0)(3a_0-a_1a_2) - a_0(a_1a_2-3a_0) - g_0\}^2$$

Which is

$$(5a) \quad g_0^2 + Bg_0 + C = 0 \implies g_0 = (-B \pm \text{SqRt}(B^2-4C))/2$$

With

$$(5b) \quad B = -2\{[(a_2^2-a_1)(a_1^2-2a_0a_2) + a_0a_2(a_2^2-2a_1)] - (a_1a_2-a_0)(3a_0-a_1a_2) - a_0(a_1a_2-3a_0)\} - (a_1a_2-a_0)^2$$

$$(5c) \quad C = \{[(a_2^2-a_1)(a_1^2-2a_0a_2) + a_0a_2(a_2^2-2a_1)] - (a_1a_2-a_0)(3a_0-a_1a_2) - a_0(a_1a_2-3a_0)\}^2 \\ - (a_1a_2-a_0)^2(-5a_0^2+2a_0a_1a_2)$$

This is now in terms of the coefficients of $f(x)$, as in the solution statement. Written in terms of G

$$(5d,e) \quad B = -2G - (a_1a_2-3a_0)^2 \text{ and } C = G^2 - (a_1a_2-a_0)^2(-5a_0^2+2a_0a_1a_2)$$

$$(5f,g) \quad G = \{[(a_2^2 - a_1)(a_1^2 - 2a_0a_2) + a_0a_2(a_2^2 - 2a_1)] - (a_1a_2 - a_0)(3a_0 - a_1a_2) - a_0(a_1a_2 - 3a_0)\} \\ = -a_0a_2^3 - a_1^3 - 2a_0^2 + 3a_0a_1a_2$$

There remains the \pm ambiguity on the solution. Following the above reasoning h_0 identically satisfies (5a). Since there are two solutions, one must be g_0 and the other h_0 . In the case of all real roots these are both positive so the largest of the two goes with the + in (5a) giving the result. Using the definitions directly one finds

$$(6a) \quad g_0 - h_0 = a^2(b^4 - c^4) + b^2(c^4 - a^4) + c^2(a^4 - b^4)$$

which can have either sign for all real roots even when $|a| < |b| < |c|$. Evaluating the difference using (4b) for g_0 and its h_0 version

$$(6b,c) \quad g_0 - h_0 = [a_1a_2 - a_0](Y - X) = [a_1a_2 - a_0][a^2(b - c) + b^2(c - a) + c^2(a - b)]$$

To obtain this totally in terms of the coefficients of $f(x)$ requires more study but can be obtained by using known equations for the roots..

It is also noted that all of the foregoing applies to complex coefficients and roots.